

CLOSED,TYPE-I

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:08-cv-00822-ESH**

ROTH v. UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Assigned to: Judge Ellen S. Huvelle
Case in other court: U. S. Court of Appeals – DC Circuit,
09–05428
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 05/12/2008
Date Terminated: 09/17/2012
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

ANTHONY C. ROTH
on behalf of Lester L. Bower, Jr.

represented by **Bradford Anthony Cangro**
MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004
(202) 739–5088
Email: bcangro@morganlewis.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Corinne Anne Niosi
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Civil Division, Commercial Litigation
1100 L Street, NW
Room 12112
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 616–0391
Fax: (202) 514–8624
Email: corinne.a.niosi@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 09/09/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY

Grace E. Speights
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20004
(202) 739–5189
Fax: (202) 739–3001
Email: gspeights@morganlewis.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Buscemi
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Seventh Floor
Washington, DC 20004–2541
(202) 739–5190
Fax: (202) 739–3001
Email: pbuscemi@morganlewis.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Craig Roth
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004
(202) 739–5188
Fax: (202) 739–3001
Email: aroth@morganlewis.com
TERMINATED: 04/05/2012

William B. Nes
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
9th Floor
Washington, DC 20004-2541
(202) 739-5779
Fax: (202) 739-3001
Email: wnes@morganlewis.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
JUSTICE**

represented by **Rhonda C. Fields**
UNITED STATES ATTORNEY'S
OFFICE
555 Fourth Street, NW
10th Floor
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-6970
Fax: (202) 514-8780
Email: rhonda.fields@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/12/2008	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Filing fee \$ 350, receipt number 4616012297) filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(jf,) (Entered: 05/14/2008)
05/12/2008		SUMMONS (3) Issued as to UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (jf,) (Entered: 05/14/2008)
05/30/2008	<u>2</u>	MOTION to Expedite <i>Schedule</i> by ANTHONY C. ROTH (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 05/30/2008)
06/02/2008	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Anthony Craig Roth on behalf of ANTHONY C. ROTH (Roth, Anthony) (Entered: 06/02/2008)
06/02/2008	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Grace E. Speights on behalf of ANTHONY C. ROTH (Speights, Grace) (Entered: 06/02/2008)
06/02/2008	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Peter Buscemi on behalf of ANTHONY C. ROTH (Buscemi, Peter) (Entered: 06/02/2008)
06/12/2008	<u>6</u>	STATUS REPORT by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibits 101-112, # <u>2</u> Ex 113, # <u>3</u> Exhibits 1-3, # <u>4</u> DOJ declaration)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/12/2008)
06/12/2008	<u>7</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>2</u> MOTION to Expedite <i>Schedule</i> filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibits 101-112, # <u>2</u> Ex 113 party index query, # <u>3</u> Exhibits 1-3, # <u>4</u> DOJ declaration, # <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/12/2008)
06/13/2008	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH.(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/13/2008)
06/17/2008		MINUTE ORDER: Based on the Court's conference call of June 13, 2008 with counsel for the parties, plaintiff's Motion for Expedited Schedule <u>2</u> is denied as moot. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 6/17/2008. (VT) (Entered: 06/17/2008)

06/17/2008	<u>9</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Rhonda C. Fields on behalf of UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/17/2008)
07/07/2008	<u>10</u>	NOTICE of Recent Development by ANTHONY C. ROTH (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 07/07/2008)
08/22/2008	<u>11</u>	STATUS REPORT by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 08/22/2008)
11/19/2008		MINUTE ORDER. Based on a conference call on November 19, 2008, the following briefing schedule has been established: defendant's motion for summary judgment is due by January 30, 2008; plaintiff's opposition is due by March 2, 2008; defendant's reply is due by March 17, 2008. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on November 19, 2008. (lcesh1) (Entered: 11/19/2008)
11/20/2008		Set/Reset Deadlines: Summary Judgment motions due by 1/30/2009. Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 3/2/2009. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 3/17/2009. (gdf) (Entered: 11/20/2008)
11/20/2008		MINUTE ORDER. The briefing schedule is amended as follows: defendant's motion for summary judgment is due by January 30, 2009; plaintiff's opposition is due by March 2, 2009; defendant's reply is due by March 17, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on November 20, 2008. (lcesh1) (Entered: 11/20/2008)
11/24/2008		Set/Reset Deadlines: Summary Judgment motions due by 1/30/2009. Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 3/2/2009. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 3/17/2009. (gdf) (Entered: 11/24/2008)
01/29/2009	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>file dispositive motion, opposition and reply</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 01/29/2009)
01/30/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>12</u> defendant's Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file its dispositive motion on or before February 4, 2009; plaintiff shall file his opposition on or before March 9, 2009; and defendant shall file its reply on or before March 24, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 1/30/2009. (VT) (Entered: 01/30/2009)
02/03/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 2/4/2009. Response to Dispositive Motions due by 3/9/2009. Reply to Dispositive Motions due by 3/24/2009. (gdf) (Entered: 02/03/2009)
02/04/2009	<u>13</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>file dispositive motion</i> , MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 02/04/2009)
02/05/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>13</u> defendant's Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file its dispositive motion on or before February 6, 2009. Plaintiff shall file his opposition on or before March 11, 2009. Defendant shall file its reply on or before March 26, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 2/5/2009. (VT) (Entered: 02/05/2009)
02/06/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 2/6/2009. Response to Dispositive Motions due by 3/11/2009. Reply to Dispositive Motions due by 3/26/2009. (gdf) (Entered: 02/06/2009)
02/06/2009	<u>14</u>	NOTICE OF BULKY FILING re <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Fields, Rhonda) Modified on 2/9/2009 (jf,). (Entered: 02/06/2009)
02/06/2009	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Hardy Dec, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 02/06/2009)
03/06/2009	<u>16</u>	Joint MOTION for Order <i>Modifying Briefing Schedule</i> by ANTHONY C. ROTH, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 03/06/2009)

03/06/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>16</u> the parties' Joint Motion for Order Modifying Briefing Schedule. Plaintiff shall file his opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment on or before April 3, 2009, and defendant shall file its reply on or before April 20, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 3/6/2009. (VT) (Entered: 03/06/2009)
03/06/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 4/3/2009. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 4/20/2009. (tr) (Entered: 03/06/2009)
04/03/2009	<u>17</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and in Support of Cross Motion for a More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review, and Response to Defendant's Statement of Material Facts Not in Dispute</i> filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–H, # <u>2</u> Declaration Anthony C. Roth, # <u>3</u> Declaration Linda Sikes)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/03/2009	<u>18</u>	Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> by ANTHONY C. ROTH (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/17/2009	<u>19</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>18</u> Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> , <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 04/17/2009)
04/17/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>19</u> Defendant's Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file its reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's cross-motion on or before June 4, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 4/17/2009. (VT) (Entered: 04/17/2009)
04/21/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Response to Cross Motions due by 6/4/2009. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 6/4/2009. (gdf) (Entered: 04/21/2009)
06/04/2009	<u>20</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>18</u> Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> , <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/04/2009)
06/04/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>20</u> defendant's Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file its reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's cross motion on or before June 8, 2009. Plaintiff shall file his reply on or before June 22, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 6/4/2009. (VT) (Entered: 06/04/2009)
06/08/2009	<u>21</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>18</u> Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> , <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment and Opposition to plaintiff's cross motion</i> filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>2</u> Hardy Dec 2, # <u>3</u> Hardy Dec 2 Exhibits part 1, # <u>4</u> Hardy Dec 2 exhibits part 2, # <u>5</u> Hardy Dec 2 Exhibits part 3, # <u>6</u> OIP Guidance, # <u>7</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 06/08/2009)
06/09/2009		Reset Deadlines: Replies due by 6/22/2009. (tj) (Entered: 06/09/2009)
06/22/2009	<u>22</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>18</u> Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> by ANTHONY C. ROTH (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 06/22/2009)
06/22/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>22</u> plaintiff's Consent Motion for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief. Plaintiff shall file his reply in support of his cross motion on or before July 1, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 6/22/2009. (VT) (Entered: 06/22/2009)

06/22/2009		Reset Deadlines: Replies due by 7/1/2009. (tj) (Entered: 06/22/2009)
07/01/2009	<u>23</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>18</u> Cross MOTION for Order <i>For More Particularized Vaugh Index or In Camera Review of Withheld and Redacted Documents</i> filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 07/01/2009)
07/07/2009		MINUTE ORDER: The Court held a conference call with the parties this date to discuss the pending motions. The parties are ordered to review the documents at issue in an effort to reduce the contested documents. They are to report back to the Court on their efforts by conference call on July 29, 2009, at 12:00 p.m. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 7/7/2009. (VT) (Entered: 07/07/2009)
07/10/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Telephone Conference set for 7/29/2009 at 12:00 PM in Chambers before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle. (gdf) (Entered: 07/10/2009)
07/29/2009		MINUTE ORDER: Based on a conference call this date, defendant shall produce additional documents on or before August 10, 2009, and defendant has agreed that it will only redact Privacy Act information (i.e., name, address, date of birth, social security number, medical information) from these documents. Second, the parties shall file a joint status report on or before August 14, 2009, that specifies what documents or categories of documents are still in dispute with respect to the three categories that were discussed on the phone call, the number of documents at issue in the first two categories, and the exemptions that are being invoked. A conference call is hereby scheduled for August 18, 2009, at 11:00 a.m. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 7/29/2009. (VT) (Entered: 07/29/2009)
08/03/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 8/14/2009. Telephone Conference set for 8/18/2009 a 11:00 AM in Chambers before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle. (gdf) (Entered: 08/03/2009)
08/14/2009	<u>24</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by ANTHONY C. ROTH, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 08/14/2009)
08/19/2009		MINUTE ORDER. For the reasons stated during the August 18, 2009 conference call, the Court grants in part <u>18</u> plaintiff's cross motion. On or before August 21, 2009, defendant shall produce for in camera review the documents referenced in the <u>24</u> August 14, 2009 status report. On or before August 21, 2009, by letter or email, both parties shall identify the portions of their briefs that address the documents in question. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 08/19/2009. (lcesh1) (Entered: 08/19/2009)
08/21/2009	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF EX PARTE IN CAMERA SUBMISSION by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 08/21/2009)
09/09/2009	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to ANTHONY C. ROTH. Attorney Corinne Anne Niosi terminated. (Niosi, Corinne) (Entered: 09/09/2009)
09/23/2009	<u>27</u>	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 09/23/09. (lcesh1) (Entered: 09/23/2009)
09/23/2009	<u>28</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>15</u> Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment for reasons stated in the accompanying Memorandum Opinion <u>27</u> . Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 09/23/09. (lcesh1) (Entered: 09/23/2009)
10/02/2009	<u>29</u>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>surveillance photographs exparte in camera</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/02/2009	<u>30</u>	MOTION for Reconsideration re <u>28</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, <u>27</u> Memorandum & Opinion by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/02/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>29</u> defendant's Motion for Leave to File Surveillance Photographs Ex Parte In Camera. Defendant shall file the fifteen photographs listed in its motion on or before Friday, October 9, 2009, for in camera review by the Court. The photographs will remain under seal until further notice of the Court. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 10/02/09. (lcesh1) (Entered: 10/02/2009)

10/02/2009		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's Fifteen Surveillance Photographs Ex Parte In Camera due by 10/9/2009. (tr) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/06/2009		MINUTE ORDER finding as moot <u>30</u> defendant's Motion for Reconsideration. Upon in camera review of the surveillance photographs submitted by defendant, the Court finds that the photographs contain identifying information and thus are appropriately withheld by defendant for the reasons discussed in the Court's September 23, 2009, memorandum opinion. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on 10/06/09. (lcesh1) (Entered: 10/06/2009)
10/13/2009	<u>31</u>	Consent MOTION to Stay re <u>28</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment (<i>partially consented</i>) by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 10/13/2009)
10/14/2009		MINUTE ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>31</u> defendant's Motion to Stay: it is hereby ORDERED that the judgment entered in this action on September 23, 2009, as modified by the Minute Order of October 6, 2009, is STAYED until December 6, 2009. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on October 14, 2009. (AG) (Entered: 10/14/2009)
10/16/2009	<u>32</u>	NOTICE by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 10/16/2009)
12/04/2009	<u>33</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Bradford Anthony Cangro on behalf of ANTHONY C. ROTH (Cangro, Bradford) (Entered: 12/04/2009)
12/04/2009	<u>34</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL as to <u>28</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, Order on Motion for Reconsideration, <u>27</u> Memorandum & Opinion by ANTHONY C. ROTH. Filing fee \$ 455, receipt number 0090-2036920. Fee Status: Fee Paid. Parties have been notified. (Cangro, Bradford) (Entered: 12/04/2009)
12/07/2009	<u>35</u>	Transmission of the Notice of Appeal, Order Appealed, and Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals. The Court of Appeals fee was paid this date re <u>34</u> Notice of Appeal,. (znmw,) (Entered: 12/07/2009)
12/07/2009		USCA Case Number 09-5428 for <u>34</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (znmw,) (Entered: 12/07/2009)
01/26/2012	<u>37</u>	MANDATE of USCA (certified copy) as to <u>34</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH ; USCA Case Number 09-5428. ORDERED and ADJUDGED that the judgment of the District Court appealed from in this cause is hereby affirmed in part, reversed in part, and the case is remanded for further proceedings, in accordance with the opinion of the court filed herein this date. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> USCA Opinion)(kb) (Entered: 02/01/2012)
01/31/2012	<u>36</u>	STATUS REPORT ORDER. Status Report due by 2/14/2012. See order for details. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on January 31, 2012. (lcesh1) (Entered: 01/31/2012)
02/14/2012	<u>38</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by William B. Nes on behalf of ANTHONY C. ROTH (Nes, William) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/14/2012	<u>39</u>	STATUS REPORT (<i>Joint</i>) by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Nes, William) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/15/2012		NOTICE OF ERROR re <u>39</u> Status Report; emailed to bnes@morganlewis.com, cc'd 7 associated attorneys — The PDF file you docketed contained errors: 1. Invalid attorney signature (jf,) (Entered: 02/15/2012)
02/16/2012		MINUTE ORDER re <u>39</u> Status Report: Upon consideration of the status report filed on 2/14/2012, it is hereby ORDERED that the schedule proposed therein is adopted. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on February 16, 2012. (AG) (Entered: 02/16/2012)
02/29/2012	<u>40</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER OF THE COURT re Order <i>Search Report</i> filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> redacted 3-page document)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 02/29/2012)

03/16/2012	<u>41</u>	RESPONSE of Plaintiff to re <u>40</u> Defendant's Search Report filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Buscemi, Peter) . (Entered: 03/16/2012)
03/19/2012	<u>42</u>	ORDER directing defendant to produce documents for the Court's in camera review and directing the parties to propose a joint briefing schedule. See order for details. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on March 19, 2012. (lcesh1) (Entered: 03/19/2012)
03/19/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Briefing Schedule due by 4/2/2012. (gdf) (Entered: 03/19/2012)
04/02/2012	<u>43</u>	NOTICE of Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule by ANTHONY C. ROTH (Buscemi, Peter) (Entered: 04/02/2012)
04/02/2012		MINUTE ORDER re <u>43</u> Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule: upon consideration of the parties' Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule, it is hereby ORDERED that the schedule is adopted; and it is further ORDERED that (1) by April 13, 2012, defendant shall file and serve a dispositive motion on any issues to be litigated concerning the FBI's search, the FBI's report, or any withholding of documents based on FOIA exemptions by April 13, 2012, and shall file and serve its position on which portions of Roth/Bower 108 and 112–113 fall within Exemptions 6 and 7(C) and which portions are segregable, non–exempt information; (2) by April 27, 2012, plaintiff shall file its opposition to any dispositive motion filed by defendant and any objections to defendants position on Roth/Bower 108 and 112–113; and (3) by May 10, 2012, defendant shall file and serve its reply. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on April 2, 2012. (AG) (Entered: 04/02/2012)
04/02/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motion due by 4/13/2012. Response to Dispositive Motion due by 4/27/2012. Reply to Dispositive Motion due by 5/10/2012. (gdf) (Entered: 04/02/2012)
04/02/2012	<u>44</u>	NOTICE OF IN CAMERA FILING UNDER SEAL by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE re <u>42</u> Order (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 04/02/2012)
04/05/2012	<u>45</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to ANTHONY C. ROTH. Attorney Anthony Craig Roth terminated. (Buscemi, Peter) (Entered: 04/05/2012)
04/13/2012	<u>46</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> 2012 Hardy Dec, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 04/13/2012)
04/27/2012	<u>47</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>46</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by ANTHONY C. ROTH. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Response to Defendant's Statement of Material Facts, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Anthony Roth, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1 to Declaration of A. Roth, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2 to Declaration of A. Roth)(Buscemi, Peter) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
05/08/2012	<u>48</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>46</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
05/08/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>48</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time to File Reply re <u>46</u> defendant's MOTION for Summary Judgment: Upon consideration of defendant's consent motion for an extension of time until May 14, 2012 in which to file its Reply, it is hereby ORDERED that the defendant's motion is GRANTED. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on May 8, 2012. (AG) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
05/14/2012	<u>49</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>46</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> May 2012 Hardy Dec)(Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 05/14/2012)
06/07/2012		MINUTE ORDER Setting Hearing on <u>46</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment: it is hereby ORDERED that a Motion Hearing on the above–referenced motion is set for 6/13/2012, at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 23A before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on June 7, 2012. (AG) (Entered: 06/07/2012)

06/13/2012	<u>50</u>	ORDER. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on June 13, 2012. (lcsh1) (Entered: 06/13/2012)
06/13/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle: Status Conference held on 6/13/2012. Status Conference set for 7/23/2012 03:00 PM in Courtroom 23A before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle. (Court Reporter Chantal Geneus) (gdf) (Entered: 06/18/2012)
07/12/2012	<u>51</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER OF THE COURT re <u>50</u> Order filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 07/12/2012)
07/23/2012	<u>52</u>	ORDER re production of documents and setting a telephone conference call, to be initiated by the parties, for August 29, 2012, at 12:30 p.m. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on July 23, 2012. (AG) (Entered: 07/23/2012)
07/23/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle: Status Conference held on 7/23/2012. Telephone Conference set for 8/29/2012 at 12:30 PM in Chambers before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle. (Court Reporter Rebecca Stonestreet) (gdf) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
08/24/2012	<u>55</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER OF THE COURT re <u>52</u> Order filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 08/24/2012)
08/30/2012		MINUTE ORDER: Pursuant to the conference call held this date, it is hereby ORDERED that, by September 6, 2012, defendant will file, on the public docket, a declaration describing the FOIA exemptions it is asserting with regard to the redacted documents attached to <u>55</u> David M. Hardy's Fourth Supplemental Declaration, and will submit ex parte, for this Court's in camera review, non-redacted copies of said documents. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on August 30, 2012. (lcsh1) (Entered: 08/30/2012)
08/30/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle: Telephone Conference held in Chambers on 8/30/2012. (gdf) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's declaration due by 9/6/2012. (gdf) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
09/06/2012	<u>56</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER OF THE COURT re Order, filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Fields, Rhonda) (Entered: 09/06/2012)
09/13/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ellen S. Huvelle: Telephone Conference held in Chambers on 9/13/2012. (gdf) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/17/2012	<u>57</u>	ORDER entering judgment for defendant and closing this case. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Ellen S. Huvelle on September 17, 2012. (lcsh1) (Entered: 09/17/2012)